

SCREEN ENCLOSURES WORKGROUP
RULE DRAFT PROPOSED REVISIONS EVALUATION WORKSHEET
MAY 16, 2012

ACCEPTABILITY RANKING EXERCISE

During the meeting members will be asked whether there are additional revisions they would like the Workgroup to evaluate, and to develop and rank proposed revisions, and following discussions and refinements, may be asked to do additional rankings of the proposed revision(s) if requested by a Workgroup member. Members should be prepared to offer specific refinements to address their reservations. The following scale will be utilized for the ranking exercises:

ACCEPTABILITY RANKING SCALE	<i>4= acceptable, I agree</i>	<i>3= acceptable, I agree with minor reservations</i>	<i>2= not acceptable, I don't agree unless major reservations addressed</i>	<i>1= not acceptable</i>
------------------------------------	-------------------------------	--	--	--------------------------

During Workgroup Meeting on May 16, 2012:

For each of the draft rule sections, members will be asked to review existing proposed revisions (if any) and invited to propose additional revisions for Workgroup consideration. A preliminary list of revisions was provided by members, and the Workgroup may add any additional revisions they deem appropriate. Once ranked, revisions with a 75% or greater number of 4's and 3's in proportion to 2's and 1's shall be considered consensus recommendations and the draft rule revised accordingly. The Workgroup's consensus recommendations will be submitted to the Commission for consideration and subsequent rule development.

KEY TO SYMBOLS	
SYMBOL	MEANING OF SYMBOL
⊕	Revision proposed to this section of the draft rule.
©	Comment on this section of the draft rule.

PROPOSED RULE TO IMPLEMENT ALTERNATE DESIGN METHOD FOR SCREEN ENCLOSURES
CHAPTER XX-X
SCREEN ENCLOSURES

Proposed Revision to “Scope” Section and Comment:

XX-X.001 Scope.


(1) ~~The~~ This purpose of this rule is to provide an alternate method for designing screen enclosures as defined by the Florida Building Code permitting the loads of the structural frame to be based on portions of the screen in the screen walls removed.

⊖ This purpose of this rule is to provide an alternate method for designing screen enclosures as defined by the Florida Building Code permitting the loads of the structural frame to be based on portions of the screen in the screen walls removed, retracted, moved to the open position or cut.

	<i>4=acceptable</i>	<i>3= minor reservations</i>	<i>2=major reservations</i>	<i>1= not acceptable</i>
<i>Initial Ranking</i> <i>05/16/12</i>				


Participants Comments and Reservations (05/16/12):

⊖ The method applies only to walls and roofs with 100% screen. No vinyl, acrylic, or other solid surface wind-break or roof panel can be used with this method.

	<i>4=acceptable</i>	<i>3= minor reservations</i>	<i>2=major reservations</i>	<i>1= not acceptable</i>
<i>Initial Ranking</i> <i>05/16/12</i>				

Participants Comments and Reservations (05/16/12):

Comment on “Scope”:


© The language should be clear that all other relevant code provisions of the FBC apply to this method, including plan review and inspections. 

XX-X.002 Design Requirements.

(1) Engineering criteria shall conform to the following.

Proposed Revision to Section a. and Comment:


- a. Screen enclosure frames designed in accordance with the screen removal alternates of this rule, shall be designed using signed and sealed site-specific engineering and shall be designed in accordance with the wind load provisions of the Florida Building Code, Section 1609.1.1.

⊖ (a.) Screen enclosure frames designed in accordance with the screen removal alternates of this rule, shall be designed using signed and sealed site-specific engineering and shall be designed in accordance with Florida Building Code, Chapter 1, Administration and  wind load provisions of the Florida Building Code, Section 1609.1.1.

	<i>4=acceptable</i>	<i>3= minor reservations</i>	<i>2=major reservations</i>	<i>1= not acceptable</i>
<i>Initial Ranking</i> <i>05/16/12</i>				

Participants Comments and Reservations (05/16/12):

Comment on (a.):


© A minimum percentage or area of screen to be removed should be stated for all designs, including 1, 2, 3 and 4 sided structures. 

	<i>4=acceptable</i>	<i>3= minor reservations</i>	<i>2=major reservations</i>	<i>1= not acceptable</i>
<i>Initial Ranking</i> <i>05/16/12</i>				

Participants Comments and Reservations (05/16/12):

Proposed Revision to Section b. and Comments:

b. Designs shall comply with Florida Building Code, Building, Section 2002.4 and Table 2002.4 using the 110 mph column and as modified by Table 2002.4A.


⊖ b. Designs that consider these screen alternates shall comply with Florida Building Code, Building, Section 2002.4 and Table 2002.4 using the 110 mph column and as modified by Table 2002.4A with all screen panels in place. 

	<i>4=acceptable</i>	<i>3= minor reservations</i>	<i>2=major reservations</i>	<i>1= not acceptable</i>
<i>Initial Ranking</i> <i>05/16/12</i>				

Participants Comments and Reservations (05/16/12):

Comments on (b.):

© What if this is a wood frame screen enclosure or other alternative material other than aluminum?

© The definition of “Screen Enclosure” includes walls and/or roof with vinyl, acrylic, or other solid surface wind breaks. A stipulation should be included for screen only. 

	<i>4=acceptable</i>	<i>3= minor reservations</i>	<i>2=major reservations</i>	<i>1= not acceptable</i>
<i>Initial Ranking</i> <i>05/16/12</i>				

Participants Comments and Reservations (05/16/12):


- c. Designs using strength design or load and resistance factor design in accordance with the Florida Building Code, Building Section 1605.2, or allowable stress design methods of the Florida Building Code, Building, Section 1605.5.3.1 shall be permitted.

PROPOSED REVISION, IF ANY: (c.)

None were proposed.

Proposed Revisions to Section d.:


- d. The design shall be by rational analysis. In addition, 3D Finite Element Analysis may be used as an analytical method but is not required for the determination of forces and moments.

ⓐ d. The design shall be by rational analysis or by 3D Element Analysis. Either method will be acceptable. 

~~The design shall be by rational analysis. In addition, 3D Finite Element Analysis may be used as an analytical method but is not required for the determination of forces and moments.~~

	<i>4=acceptable</i>	<i>3= minor reservations</i>	<i>2=major reservations</i>	<i>1= not acceptable</i>
<i>Initial Ranking 05/16/12</i>				

Participants Comments and Reservations (05/16/12):


ⓐ d. The design shall be by rational analysis, and by 3D Element Analysis is not required. 

~~The design shall be by rational analysis. In addition, 3D Finite Element Analysis may be used as an analytical method but is not required for the determination of forces and moments.~~

	<i>4=acceptable</i>	<i>3= minor reservations</i>	<i>2=major reservations</i>	<i>1= not acceptable</i>
<i>Initial Ranking 05/16/12</i>				

Participants Comments and Reservations (05/16/12):

Proposed New Section: e.


ⓐ e. Designs that consider these screen alternates shall also comply with Florida Building Code, Building, Section 2002.4 and Table 2002.4 using the applicable mph column and as modified by Table 2002.4A without the influence of designated screen panels. 

	<i>4=acceptable</i>	<i>3= minor reservations</i>	<i>2=major reservations</i>	<i>1= not acceptable</i>
<i>Initial Ranking 05/16/12</i>				

Participants Comments and Reservations (05/16/12):


Proposed Revisions to Section (2) and Comment:

(2) Where screen enclosures are designed in accordance with the screen removal alternates of this rule, removable screen may consist of removable panels, retractable panels, or by designating specific screen panels in the design in which the screen is to be removed by cutting the screen. Removable panels shall be removed, retractable panels shall be placed in the retracted position, and screen designated in the design to be cut shall be cut shall be completely cut when wind speeds are forecast to exceed 75 mph.

⊖ (2) Where screen enclosures are designed in accordance with the screen removal alternates of this rule, removable screen may consist of removable panels, retractable panels, or by designating specific screen panels in the design in which the screen is to be removed by cutting the screen. Removable panels shall be removed, retractable panels shall be placed in the retracted position, and screen designated in the design to be cut shall be ~~cut shall be~~ completely cut when wind speeds are forecast to exceed 75 mph. 


	<i>4=acceptable</i>	<i>3= minor reservations</i>	<i>2=major reservations</i>	<i>1= not acceptable</i>
<i>Initial Ranking</i> <i>05/16/12</i>				

Participants Comments and Reservations (05/16/12):

⊖ (2) Where screen enclosures are designed in accordance with the screen removal alternates of this rule, removable screen may consist of removable panels, retractable panels, or by designating specific screen panels in the design in which the screen is to be removed by cutting the screen. Removable panels shall be removed, retractable panels shall be placed in the retracted position without increasing the screen density of any other screen panel,  screen designated in the design to be cut shall be cut shall be completely cut when wind speeds are forecast to exceed 75 mph.


	<i>4=acceptable</i>	<i>3= minor reservations</i>	<i>2=major reservations</i>	<i>1= not acceptable</i>
<i>Initial Ranking</i> <i>05/16/12</i>				

Participants Comments and Reservations (05/16/12):

⊖ (2) Where screen enclosures are designed in accordance with the screen removal alternates of this rule, removable screen may consist of removable panels, retractable panels, or by designating specific screen panels in the design in which the screen is to be removed by cutting the screen. Removable panels shall be removed, retractable panels shall be placed in the retracted position, and screen designated in the design to be cut shall be ~~completely cut when wind speeds are forecast to exceed 75 mph~~ cut horizontally along the length of the chair rail and vertically against each column to the maximum height possible without the use of a ladder or scaffolding when winds are forecast by the National Hurricane Center to be in excess of 75mph. 

	<i>4=acceptable</i>	<i>3= minor reservations</i>	<i>2=major reservations</i>	<i>1= not acceptable</i>
<i>Initial Ranking</i> <i>05/16/12</i>				


Participants Comments and Reservations (05/16/12):

⊖ (2) All screen panels on all walls, from the top of wall to four (4) feet above the enclosure floor must be cut or removed. 

	4= <i>acceptable</i>	3= <i>minor reservations</i>	2= <i>major reservations</i>	1= <i>not acceptable</i>
<i>Initial Ranking</i> 05/16/12				

Participants Comments and Reservations (05/16/12):

Comments on (2):

⊙ Minimum signs or placards should be specified 

	4= <i>acceptable</i>	3= <i>minor reservations</i>	2= <i>major reservations</i>	1= <i>not acceptable</i>
<i>Initial Ranking</i> 05/16/12				

Participants Comments and Reservations (05/16/12):


(3) Where screen enclosures designed in accordance with the screen removal alternates of this rule serve as the barrier required by the Florida Building Code at Sections 424.2.17 and R4101.17.1, the required minimum height of the barrier shall be maintained when screen panels are retracted, removed, moved to the open position, or cut.

PROPOSED REVISION, IF ANY: (3)

None were proposed.

Proposed Revisions to Section (4) and Comment:

(4) Where screen enclosures are designed in accordance with the screen removal alternates of this rule, retractable screen panels, removable screen panels, and screen panels identified to be cut shall be clearly identified with highly visible permanent labels or by other means approved by the local building department.

⊖ (4) Where screen enclosures are designed in accordance with the screen removal alternates of this rule, retractable screen panels, removable screen panels, and screen panels identified to be cut shall be clearly identified on adjacent structural member with highly visible permanent labels or by other means approved by the local building department. 

	4= <i>acceptable</i>	3= <i>minor reservations</i>	2= <i>major reservations</i>	1= <i>not acceptable</i>
<i>Initial Ranking</i> 05/16/12				

Participants Comments and Reservations (05/16/12):

⊗ Where screen enclosures are designed in accordance with the screen removal alternates of this rule, retractable screen panels, removable screen panels, and screen panels identified to be cut shall be clearly identified with highly visible permanent labels, at each panel, or by other means approved by the local building department.

	<i>4=acceptable</i>	<i>3= minor reservations</i>	<i>2=major reservations</i>	<i>1= not acceptable</i>
<i>Initial Ranking</i> <i>05/16/12</i>				

Participants Comments and Reservations (05/16/12):

Comments on (4):

⊗ Minimum size, clarity and permanence of signs or placards should be specified.

	<i>4=acceptable</i>	<i>3= minor reservations</i>	<i>2=major reservations</i>	<i>1= not acceptable</i>
<i>Initial Ranking</i> <i>05/16/12</i>				

Participants Comments and Reservations (05/16/12):

Proposed Revision to Section (5):

(5) Where screen enclosures are designed in accordance with the screen removal alternates of this rule, the retraction of screen panels, removal of screen panels, or cutting of screen panels shall not require the use of ladders or scaffolding.

⊗ Cutting screen panels can only be approved up to eight (8) feet above the enclosure floor. Other methods of removing the screen must be specified over eight (8) feet above the enclosure floor. ☹

	<i>4=acceptable</i>	<i>3= minor reservations</i>	<i>2=major reservations</i>	<i>1= not acceptable</i>
<i>Initial Ranking</i> <i>05/16/12</i>				

Participants Comments and Reservations (05/16/12):

Proposed Revisions to Section (6):

(6) Engineering documents submitted with building permit applications shall identify the panels to be removed, retracted, opened, or cut.

⊗ Engineering documents submitted with building permit applications shall identify the panels to be removed, retracted, opened, or cut, and a minimum percentage or area. ☹

	<i>4=acceptable</i>	<i>3= minor reservations</i>	<i>2=major reservations</i>	<i>1= not acceptable</i>
<i>Initial Ranking</i> <i>05/16/12</i>				

Participants Comments and Reservations (05/16/12):

⊖ All screen panels on all walls, from the top of wall to four (4) feet above the enclosure floor must be cut or removed

	4=acceptable	3= minor reservations	2=major reservations	1= not acceptable
Initial Ranking 05/16/12				

Participants Comments and Reservations (05/16/12):

Proposed Revision to Section (7):

(7) Actual wall thickness of extruded structural aluminum members shall be not less than 0.040 inch (1mm).

⊖ Actual wall thickness of extruded structural aluminum members shall be not less than 0.040 inch (1mm). [Covered in FBC 2002.3.1.] {Proposed to delete this section as unnecessary}

	4=acceptable	3= minor reservations	2=major reservations	1= not acceptable
Initial Ranking 05/16/12				

Participants Comments and Reservations (05/16/12):

(8) Where screen enclosures are designed in accordance with the screen removal alternates of this rule based on removing screen panels by cutting the screen, the contractor shall provide replacement screen for a one-time replacement of all screen and spline designated by the design to be cut.

PROPOSED REVISION, IF ANY: (8)

None were proposed.


Proposed Revisions to closing Section:

Where screen enclosures are designed in accordance with the screen removal alternates of this rule, the contractor shall provide notice to the homeowner and the local building code enforcement department that the homeowner must retract, remove, or cut a panel or panels of the screen enclosure in accordance with the project engineering design or the manufacturer’s instructions when wind speeds are expected to exceed 75 mph.

⊖ Where screen enclosures are designed in accordance with the screen removal alternates of this rule, the contractor shall provide notice to the property owner ~~homeowner~~ and the local building code enforcement department that the property owner ~~homeowner~~ must retract, remove, or cut a panel or panels of the screen enclosure in accordance with the project engineering design or the manufacturer’s instructions when wind speeds are expected to exceed 75 mph.

	4=acceptable	3= minor reservations	2=major reservations	1= not acceptable
Initial Ranking 05/16/12				

Participants Comments and Reservations (05/16/12):

Ⓞ An affidavit, describing the “less strict engineering method” and signed by the home owner must be submitted with the Permit Application. 

	<i>4=acceptable</i>	<i>3= minor reservations</i>	<i>2=major reservations</i>	<i>1= not acceptable</i>
<i>Initial Ranking 05/16/12</i>				

Participants Comments and Reservations (05/16/12):